# BEFORE THE MEDICAL BOARD OF CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS STATE OF CALIFORNIA

<b>ded</b> ) ) )		
M.D. )	Case No.	06-2009-200256
)		
)		
)		
	)	)

#### **DECISION**

The attached Stipulated Surrender of License and Order is hereby adopted as the Decision and Order of the Medical Board of California, Department of Consumer Affairs, State of California.

This Decision shall become effective at 5:00 p.m. on July 30, 2014.

IT IS SO ORDERED July 23, 2014 ......

MEDICAL BOARD OF CALIFORNIA

Kimberly Kirchmeyer

**Executive Director** 

1	KAMALA D. HARRIS			
2	Attorney General of California ROBERT MCKIM BELL			
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General TRINA L. SAUNDERS			
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 207764			
5	California Department of Justice 300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702			
6	Los Angeles, CA 90013 Telephone: (213) 620-2193			
7	Facsimile: (213) 897-9395 Attorneys for Complainant			
8	BEFORE THE			
9	MEDICAL BOARD OF CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS			
10	STATE OF CALIFORNIA			
11	In the Matter of the Second Amended	Case No. 06-2009-200256		
12	Accusation Against:	OAH No. 2013110044		
13	CONRAD ROBERT MURRAY, M.D.	STIPULATED SURRENDER OF LICENSE AND ORDER		
14	P.O. Box 72216 Las Vegas, NV 89170	LICENSE AND ORDER		
15	Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate G-71169,			
16	Respondent.			
17				
18				
19	IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND A	GREED by and between the parties to the above-		
20	entitled proceedings that the following matters are true:			
21	<u>PARTIES</u>			
22	1. Kimberly Kirchmeyer (Complainant) is the Executive Director of the Medical Board			
23	of California ("Board"). She brought this action solely in her official capacity and is represented			
24	in this matter by Kamala D. Harris, Attorney General of the State of California, by Trina L.			
25	Saunders, Deputy Attorney General.			
26	2. Conrad Robert Murray, M.D. ("Respondent") is represented in this proceeding by			
27	attorney J. Michael Flanagan, whose address is 1156 Brand Boulevard, Glendale, California			
28	91202.			
		1		

3. On April 22, 1991, the Medical Board of California issued Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate number G-71169 to Respondent. That license was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought in Accusation No. 06-2009-200256 and has expired.

#### **JURISDICTION**

4. A Second Amended Accusation in case number 06-2009-200256 was filed before the Board and is currently pending against Respondent. The Second Amended Accusation and all other statutorily required documents were properly served on Respondent on December 12, 2013. Respondent timely filed a Notice of Defense contesting the charges. A copy of the Second Amended Accusation in case number 06-2009-200256 is attached as Exhibit A and is incorporated by reference.

#### **ADVISEMENT AND WAIVERS**

- 5. Respondent has carefully read, fully discussed with counsel, and understands the charges and allegations in Second Amended Accusation No. 06-2009-200256. Respondent also has carefully read, fully discussed with counsel, and understands the effects of this Stipulated Surrender of License and Order.
- 6. Respondent is fully aware of his legal rights in this matter, including his right to a hearing on the charges and allegations in the Second Amended Accusation; his right to be represented by counsel, at his own expense; his right to confront and cross-examine the witnesses against him; his right to present evidence and to testify on his own behalf; his right to the issuance of subpoenas to compel the attendance of witnesses and the production of documents; his right to reconsideration and court review of an adverse decision; and all other rights accorded by the California Administrative Procedure Act and other applicable laws.
- 7. Respondent voluntarily, knowingly and intelligently waives and gives up each and every right set forth above.

#### **CULPABILITY**

8. Respondent admits that the truth of the First Cause for Discipline and the allegations in support of same contained in the Second Amended Accusation No. 06-2009-200256, and

agrees that cause exists for discipline and hereby surrenders his Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G-71169 for the Board's formal acceptance.

9. Respondent understands that by signing this stipulation he enables the Board to issue an order accepting the surrender of his Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate without further process.

#### **CONTINGENCY**

- 10. This stipulation shall be subject to approval by the Medical Board of California. Respondent understands and agrees that counsel for Complainant and the staff of the Medical Board of California may communicate directly with the Board regarding this stipulation and surrender, without notice to or participation by Respondent or his counsel. By signing the stipulation, Respondent understands and agrees that he may not withdraw his agreement or seek to rescind the stipulation prior to the time the Board considers and acts upon it. If the Board fails to adopt this stipulation as its Decision and Order, the Stipulated Surrender and Disciplinary Order shall be of no force or effect, except for this paragraph, it shall be inadmissible in any legal action between the parties, and the Board shall not be disqualified from further action by having considered this matter.
- 11. The Medical Board of California will process this action in the same manner that it processes all disciplinary matters, which includes not holding a press conference or issuing a press release.
- 12. The parties understand and agree that Portable Document Format (PDF) and facsimile copies of this Stipulated Surrender of License and Order, including Portable Document Format (PDF) and facsimile signatures thereto, shall have the same force and effect as the originals.
- 13. In consideration of the foregoing admissions and stipulations, the parties agree that the Board may, without further notice or formal proceeding, issue and enter the following Order:

#### **ORDER**

**IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT** Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G-71169, issued to Respondent Conrad Robert Murray, M.D., is surrendered and accepted by the Medical Board of California.

- The surrender of Respondent's Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate and the accommode of the surrendered license by the Board shall constitute the imposition of discipline against Respondent. This stipulation constitutes a record of the discipline and shall become a part of Respondent's license history with the Medical Board of California.
- Respondent shall lose all rights and privileges as a physician and surgeon to California as of the effective date of the Board's Decision and Order
- 3 Respondent shall cause to be delivered to the Board his pocket beense and, if one was issued, his watt certificate on or before the effective date of the Decision and Order.
- 1. If Respondent ever tiles an application for licensure or a petition for reinstanement in the State of California, the Board shall treat it as a petition for reinstanement. Respondent must comply with all the laws, regulations and procedures for reinstatement of a revoked license in effect at the time the petition is filed, and all of the charges and allegations contained in Second Amended Accusation No. 06-2009-200256 shall be deemed to be true, correct and admitted by Respondent when the Board determines whether to grant or deny the petition

#### ACCEPTANCE

Universatefully read the above Stipulated Surrender of License and Order and have fully discussed it with my attorney. I Michael Flanagan I understand the supulation and the effect it will have on my Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate. I enter into this Stipulated Surrender of License and Order voluntarily, knowingly, and intelligently, and agree to be bound by the Decision and Order of the Medical Board of California

DATED \$ 6/30/14

ONBAD ROBERT MORAY, M.D.

Hespandent

Thave read and fully discussed with Respondent Contact Robert Murray, M.D. the terms and conditions and other matters contained in this Stipulated Surrender of License and Order. I approve its form and content.

DATED

Attorney for Respondent

\$

28

20

### **ENDORSEMENT** The foregoing Stipulated Surrender of License and Order is hereby respectfully submitted for consideration by the Medical Board of California of the Department of Consumer Affairs. Respectfully submitted, Dated: an 30, 2014 KAMALA D. HARRIS Attorney General of California ROBERT MCKIM BELL Supervising Deputy Attorney General Sundays TRINA L. SAUNDERS Deputy Attorney General Attorneys for Complainant LA2012602155 61291428.doc

## Exhibit A

Second Amended Accusation, MBC Case No. 06-2009-200256

FILED STATE OF CALIFORNIA MEDICAL BOARD OF CALIFORNIA 1 KAMALA D. HARRIS Attorney General of California 2 ROBERT MCKIM BELL Supervising Deputy Attorney General 3 TRINA L. SAUNDERS Deputy Attorney General 4 State Bar No. 207764 California Department of Justice 5 300 South Spring Street, Suite 1702 Los Angeles, California 90013 6 Telephone: (213) 620-2193 Facsimile: (213) 897-9395 7 Attorneys for Complainant 8 BEFORE THE MEDICAL BOARD OF CALIFORNIA 9 DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS STATE OF CALIFORNIA 10 11 Case No. 06-2009-200256 In the Matter of the Second Amended Accusation Against: 12 CONRAD ROBERT MURRAY, M.D. 13 SECOND AMENDED ACCUSATION Post Office Box 72216 14 Las Vegas, Nevada 89170 15 Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G71169, 16 Respondent. 17 18 Complainant alleges: **PARTIES** 19 Kimberly Kirchmeyer (Complainant) brings this Accusation solely in her official 20 capacity as the interim Executive Director of the Medical Board of California, Department of 21 22 Consumer Affairs. On or about April 22, 1991, the Medical Board of California issued Physician's and 23 2. Surgeon's Certificate Number G71169 to Conrad Robert Murray, M.D. (Respondent). That 24 license was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein. On January 25 11, 2011, following a preliminary hearing in Los Angeles Superior Court Case Number 26 SA073164, regarding involuntary manslaughter charges filed against Respondent relating to the 27 medical care of patient M.J., the court bound Respondent over for trial. As a condition of bail, 28

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

of law shall be deemed to refer to the Board.

"(b) Any matter heard pursuant to subdivision (a), except for warning letters, medical review or advisory conferences, professional competency examinations, continuing education activities, and cost reimbursement associated therewith that are agreed to with the division and successfully completed by the licensee, or other matters made confidential or privileged by existing law, is deemed public, and shall be made available to the public by the board pursuant to Section 803.1."

#### 5. Section 2234 of the Code states:

"The Division of Medical Quality shall take action against any licensee who is charged with unprofessional conduct. In addition to other provisions of this article, unprofessional conduct includes, but is not limited to, the following:

- "(a) Violating or attempting to violate, directly or indirectly, assisting in or abetting the violation of, of or conspiring to violate any provision of this chapter [Chapter 5, the Medical Practice Act].
  - "(b) Gross negligence.
- "(c) Repeated negligent acts. To be repeated, there must be two or more negligent acts or omissions. An initial negligent act or omission followed by a separate and distinct departure from the applicable standard of care shall constitute repeated negligent acts.
- "(1) An initial negligent diagnosis followed by an act or omission medically appropriate for the negligent diagnosis of the patient shall constitute a single negligent act.
- "(2) When the standard of care requires a change in the diagnosis, act, or omission that constitutes the negligent act described in paragraph (1), including, but not limited to, a reevaluation of the diagnosis or a change in treatment, and the licensee's conduct departs from the applicable standard of care, each departure constitutes a separate and distinct breach of the standard of care.
  - "(d) Incompetence.
- "(e) The commission of any act involving dishonesty or corruption which is substantially related to the qualifications, functions, or duties of a physician and surgeon.
  - "(f) Any action or conduct which would have warranted the denial of a certificate."

6. Section 2305 of the Code states:

"The revocation, suspension, or other discipline, restriction, or limitation imposed by another state upon a license or certificate to practice medicine issued by that state, or the revocation, suspension, or restriction of the authority to practice medicine by any agency of the federal government, that would have been grounds for discipline in California of a licensee under this chapter, shall constitute grounds for disciplinary action for unprofessional conduct against the licensee in the state."

- 7. Section 141 of the Code states:
- "(a) For any licensee holding a license issued by a board under the jurisdiction of the department, a disciplinary action taken by another state, by any agency of the federal government, or by another country for any act substantially related to the practice regulated by the California license, may be a ground for disciplinary action by the respective state licensing board. A certified copy of the record of the disciplinary action taken against the licensee by another state, an agency of the federal government, or another country shall be conclusive evidence of the events related therein.
- "(b) Nothing in this section shall preclude a board from applying a specific statutory provision in the licensing act administered by that board that provides for disciplinary action taken against the licensee by another state, an agency for the federal government, or another country."
  - 8. Section 2236 of the Code states:
- "(a) The Conviction of any offense substantially related to the qualifications, functions,, or duties of a physician and surgeon constitutes unprofessional conduct within the meaning of this chapter. The record of conviction shall be conclusive evidence only of the fact that the conviction occurred.
- "(b) The district attorney, city attorney, or other prosecuting agency shall notify the Division of Medical Quality of the pendency of an action against a licensee charging a felony or misdemeanor immediately upon obtaining information that the defendant is a licensee. The notice shall identify the licensee and describe the crimes charged and the facts alleged. The

prosecuting agency shall also notify the clerk of the court in which the action is pending that the defendant is a licensee, and the clerk shall record prominently in the file that the defendant holds a license as a physician and surgeon.

- "(c) The clerk of the court in which a licensee is convicted of a crime shall within 48 hours after the conviction, transmit a certified copy of the record of conviction to the board. The division may inquire into the circumstances surrounding the commission of a crime in order to fix the degree of discipline or to determine if the conviction is of an offense substantially related to the qualifications, functions, or duties of a physician and surgeon.
- "(d) A plea or verdict of guilty or a conviction after a plea of nolo contendere is deemed to be a conviction within the meaning of this section and Section 2236.1. The record of conviction shall be conclusive evidence of the fact that the conviction occurred."
  - 9. Section 2236.1 of the Code states:
- "(a) A physician and surgeon's certificate shall be suspended automatically during any time that the holder of the certificate is incarcerated after conviction of a felony, regardless of whether the conviction has been appealed. The Division of Medical Quality shall, immediately upon receipt of the certified copy of the record of conviction, determine whether the certificate of the physician and surgeon has been automatically suspended by virtue of his or her incarceration, and if so, the duration of that suspension. The division shall notify the physician and surgeon of the license suspension and of his or her right to elect to have the issue of penalty heard as provided in this section.
- "(b) Upon receipt of the certified copy of the record of conviction, if after a hearing it is determined there from that the felony of which the licensee was convicted was substantially related to the qualifications, functions, or duties of a physician and surgeon, the Division of Medical Quality shall suspend the license until the time for appeal has elapsed, if no appeal has been taken, or until the judgment of conviction has been affirmed on appeal or has otherwise become final, and until further order of the division. The issue of substantial relationship shall be heard by and administrative law judge from the Medical Quality Panel sitting alone or with a panel of the division, in the discretion of the division.

- "(c) Notwithstanding subdivision (b), a conviction of any crime referred to in Section 2237, or a conviction of Section 187, 261, 262 or 288 of the Penal Code, shall be conclusively presumed to be substantially related to the qualifications, functions, or duties of a physician and surgeon and no hearing shall be held on this issue. Upon its own motion or for good cause shown, the division may decline to impose or may set aside the suspension when it appears to be in the interest of justice to do so, with due regard to maintaining the integrity of and confidence in the medical profession.
- "(d) (1) Discipline may be ordered in accordance with Section 2227, or the Division of Licensing may order the denial of the license when the time for appeal has elapsed, the judgment of conviction has been affirmed on appeal, or an order granting probation is made suspending the imposition of sentence, irrespective of a subsequent order under Section 1203.4 of the Penal Code allowing the person to withdraw his or her plea of guilty and to enter a plea of not guilty, setting aside the verdict of guilty, or dismissing the accusation, complaint, information, or indictment.
- "(2) The issue of penalty shall be heard by an administrative law judge from the Medical Quality Panel sitting alone or with a panel of the division, in the discretion of the division. The hearing shall not be had until the judgment of conviction has become final or, irrespective of a subsequent order under Section 1203.4 of the Penal Code, an order granting probation has been made suspending the imposition of sentence; except that a licensee may, at his or her option, elect to have the issue of penalty decided before those time periods have elapsed. Where the licensee so elects, the issue of penalty shall be heard in the manner described in this section at the hearing to determine whether the conviction was substantially related to the qualifications, functions, or duties of a physician and surgeon. If the conviction of a licensee who has made this election is overturned on appeal, any discipline ordered pursuant to this section shall automatically cease.

Nothing in this subdivision shall prohibit the division from pursuing disciplinary action based on any cause other than the overturned conviction.

"(c) The record of the proceedings resulting in the conviction, including a transcript of the testimony therein, may be received in evidence.

- "(f) The other provisions of this article setting forth a procedure for the suspension or revocation of a physician and surgeon's certificate shall not apply to proceedings conducted pursuant to this section."
  - 10. Section 1360 of Title 16 of the California Code of Regulations states:

"For the purposes of denial, suspension or revocation of a license, certificate or permit pursuant to Division 1.5 (commencing with Section 475) of the code, a crime or act shall be considered to be substantially related to the qualifications, functions or duties of a person holding a license, certificate or permit under the Medial Practice Act if to a substantial degree it evidences present or future potential unfitness of a person holding a license, certificate or permit in a manner consistent with the public health, safety or welfare. Such crimes or acts shall include but not be limited to the following: Violating or attempting to violate directly or indirectly or assisting in or abetting the violation of, or conspiring to violate any provision of the Medical Practice Act."

11. Section 118, subdivision (b), of the Code states, in relevant part, as follows:

"The suspension, expiration, or forfeiture by operation of law of a license issued by a board in the department [...] shall not, during any period in which it may be renewed, restored, reissued, or reinstated, deprive the board of its authority to institute or continue a disciplinary proceeding against the licensee upon any ground provided by law or to enter an order suspending or revoking the license or otherwise taking disciplinary action against the licensee on any such ground."

#### FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Conviction of a Crime)

- 12. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under Business and Professions Code section 2236, and 2236.1 based on his conviction of a crime which is substantially related to the qualifications, functions or duties of a physician. The circumstances are as follows:
- 13. On February 8, 2010, in a criminal proceeding entitled, *People of the State of California v. Conrad Murray*, Los Angeles Superior Court Case Number SA073164, Respondent was charged with the involuntary manslaughter of his patient M.J. Respondent pled not guilty.

14. On November 7, 2011, following a jury trial, Conrad Murray, M.D., was found guilty of one count of involuntary manslaughter as alleged in Count 1 of the felony complaint which stated as follows:

"On or about June 25, 2009, in the County of Los Angeles, the crime of involuntary MANSLAUGHTER, in violation of PENAL CODE SECTION 192(b), a Felony, was committed by CONRAD ROBERT MURRAY, who did unlawfully and without malice, kill MICHAEL JOSEPH JACKSON, a human being, in the commission of an unlawful act, not amounting to a felony; and in the commission of a lawful act which might have produced death, in an unlawful manner, and without caution and circumspection."

At the time of the offense in question the victim was a patient of Respondent and receiving medical care. Following the reading of the verdict, Respondent was denied bail and remanded into custody.

- 15. On November 29, 2011, the court sentenced Respondent to the upper term of four (4) years in prison, to be served in the Los Angeles County Jail, pursuant to the provisions of Penal Code section 1170<sup>3</sup>. The circumstances with respect to the conviction are as follows:
- 16. From April, 2009, through June 25, 2009, the date of patient M.J.'s death, Respondent acted as M.J.'s personal physician.
- 17. Respondent's conviction is substantially related to the practice of medicine within the meaning of section 2236 and 2236.1 of the Code. His acts and omissions in the treatment and care of patient M.J. resulted in manslaughter. Therefore, cause for discipline exists.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Penal Code section 192, subdivision (b), defines involuntary manslaughter as follows: "Manslaughter is the unlawful killing of a human being without malice. It is of three kinds: [...] (b) Involuntary — in the commission of an unlawful act, not amounting to felony; or in the commission of a lawful act which might produce death, in an unlawful manner, or without due caution and circumspection. This subdivision shall not apply to acts committed in the driving of a vehicle."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Penal Code section 1170 (b), states in pertinent part that, "when a judgment of imprisonment is to be imposed and the statute specifies three possible terms, the court shall order imposition of the middle term, unless there are circumstances in aggravation or mitigation of the crime. [...] The court shall set forth on the record the facts and reasons for imposing the upper or lower term."

#### SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Out of State Discipline)

- 18. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to sections 2305 and 141 of the Code in that on or about August 30, 2013, the State of Texas Medical Board, in an action entitled, In the Matter of the Complaint Against Conrad Murray, M.D., SOAH Docket No. 503-13-1688.MD, revoked Respondent's Texas medical license.
- 19. Respondent's Texas medical license was revoked based on his 2011 felony conviction for manslaughter in Los Angeles Superior Court Case No. SA073164. Respondent contested the case filed by the Texas Medical Board. The Texas Medical Board determined that there was no issue of material fact and summarily disciplined Respondent's license.
- 20. The foregoing facts constitute grounds for discipline for unprofessional conduct pursuant to sections 2305 of the Code and constitutes grounds for discipline pursuant to section 141 of the Code.

#### DISCIPLINARY CONSIDERATIONS

- 21. To determine the degree of discipline, if any, to be imposed on Respondent, Complainant alleges as follows:
- 22. On or about March 11, 2011, in Medical Board of California Case No. 16-2010-211878, a prior disciplinary action, a public letter of reprimand was issued against Respondent's medical license.
- A. The Nevada Board found that Respondent provided inaccurate and incomplete statements on his 2007 and 2009 applications for licensure renewal, as Respondent failed to notify the Nevada Board that he was in arrears and not in compliance with a State of California court ordered child support obligation.
- B. The actions of Respondent violated California Business and Professions Code sections 141(a), 2234 and 2305.
- C. Pursuant to the authority of the California Business and Professions Code section 2233, Respondent was issued a public letter of reprimand by the Medical Board of California.